

Terms of Reference

CREATING DEVELOPMENT WITH WATER AND TREES PROGRAM EVALUATION

August 2010

Background

The construction of Sand Dams in Kenya towards improved water access for household and food production has been carried out for many years. Excellent Development first began constructing this technology in an experimental/pilot phase in the late 1980's. Given the advantages and success demonstrated by the sand dams and access to water for the communities; funding support to extend this technology was sought. SASOL began expanding on this technology and extending it to communities as early as 1995, while Excellent Development began extension in 2002.

MCC and CFGB have provided support towards the construction of sand dams since the late 1990's. Support for the construction of sand dams was provided to reduce the risk to disasters for the vulnerable population in Kenya lacking in water for their household use, as well as their food production. Prior to the current projects, SASOL had constructed approximately 370 sand dams, while Excellent Development Kenya had built about 130. MCC and CFGB had provided support for approximately 25 of these dams. Excellent Development Kenya is in their final year of a 5-year project in which they constructed 247 dams (including the targeted 46 to be completed this year). SASOL is in their 4th year of a 5-year project and (including the targeted dams for the current year) will have completed 200 dams by the end of this current year, and 250 dams by the end of year 5.

Excellent Development Kenya (EDK), now called Utooni Development Organization (UDO), is supporting community self-help groups in semi-arid areas of Eastern Kenya. The current five-year grant from MCC/CFGB started in April 2006. The goal of the project is for rural communities in Kathonzweni, Kibwezi, Machakos, Makueni, Mbooni East and West, Mwala and Nzau Districts to obtain water, food, and income security and improve health. Community self-help groups are appealing to EDK/UDO for help in creating sand dams and making terraces and planting trees to alleviate these conditions.

Kitui district is one of 12 districts in Eastern Province. The land area is 20,402 km² and the population exceeds 500,000. It is drought prone and a combination of excessive livestock grazing with drought has denuded ground cover and contributed to soil erosion. As a result, seasonal malnutrition is common in some households and periodic crop failures requiring famine relief are endemic to the district. Some homes have shallow wells, but most dry up during periods of drought. Boreholes have not been particularly effective and salinity is a significant problem, especially in Mutomo and Mutha divisions in the southern part of Kitui. Therefore, addressing water supply is strategic for food security, improved health and development initiatives in Kitui district.

Extending and stabilizing water supply is central to realizing improved food security:

- Water availability increases staple food production by expanding the growing season and enabling some food production when rains are minimal or fail completely, which, in turn, reduces a need for periodic famine relief;
- Water enables the production of vegetables and some fruit, making possible a more balanced, healthier diet;
- Increased water supply may facilitate expanded livestock production which contributes to land productivity as draught animals and through the provision of manure as well as expanding food supply in the form of milk and meat;

- Accessible water sets women and girls free from extended hours of labor devoted to water collection for primary household needs, enabling girls to remain in school and providing women with new opportunities for productive activities in the community;
- An increase in water supply at household levels facilitates improved sanitation and overall cleanliness, hence reducing morbidity.
- Better quality water for personal consumption reduces the incidence of diarrhea, which increases the body's ability to absorb nutrients from food intake, increasing overall food security;
- A combination of the above plus potential cash crop production through selected irrigation is expanding household income, enabling families to provide for their needs during emergencies such as drought as well as opening up opportunities for increased saving, investment and production.

Following an evaluation of the SASOL sand dams in 2004, in March 2005 MCC and CFGB entered into a five-year partnership for development agreement with Excellent Development Kenya (EDK) as well as with SASOL. Management plans were developed with a goal to advance capacity of selected communities in Machakos and Makueni districts as well as Kitui district to increase water and soil conservation as a means to greater water, food and income security. The plans (for each partner) included an external assessment at the end of the projects to determine the outcome of this work, achievement towards the goals of the projects, as well as inform future programming. This assessment, therefore will review the achievements of the two projects towards their stated goals, ie. Excellent Development - 'Creating Development with Water and Trees' and SASOL - 'Creating Food Security with Water and Trees'. While reviewing the overall impact of the project in the participating communities, the assessment will explore the contribution of sand dams to reduce the food insecurity of the local population.

Purpose of Evaluation

1. To assess the effectiveness of the sand dams towards addressing chronic food insecurity in the project communities.
2. To assess the overall outputs and impact of the Kenya Sand Dam intervention.
3. To assess the impact and sustainability of these programmes, including the unintended consequences.
4. To assess performance in terms of the quality of design (including technical evaluation of recharge, construction methods and water quality), relevance of results, efficiency of implementation and sustainability.
5. To provide insight into the efficiency and economy of supporting longer-term food security using the current methodology.
6. To provide insights into strengths and challenges of current project and provide recommendations for future programming.

Specific Issues

A key underlying question of this review will be, "In relation to inputs to the two sand dam projects (Creating Development with Water and Trees, and 'Creating Food Security with Water and Trees) as outlined in the respective management plans, how has the quality of life changed (for better or worse) for the participating communities, including the effect on food security. The various program components will be reviewed in light of this guiding question.

Methodology

MCC and CFGB are in partnership with two Kenyan partners (EDK and SASOL) each

operating independently and each having a different development approach. Utooni works with registered, organized self help groups (SHG) that have worked together for six months, while SASOL starts with a new group organized with local government for the specific work of the sand dams. Since both programs are similar, this review guide could apply to both projects. However, MCC feels the approaches are different enough to recommend/warrant separate reports. The aim for this assessment is to provide value for the partners as well as MCC and CFGB.

MCC/CFGB will contract with a consultant (who will work collaboratively with a Kenya consultant as outlined in Evaluator qualifications) to prepare an evaluation work plan to operationalize and direct the evaluation. The work plan will describe how the evaluation will be carried out, bringing refinements, specificity and elaboration to the terms of reference.

The evaluation work-plan will address the following reporting elements:

- Project overview
- Expectations of evaluation
- Roles and Responsibilities,
- Evaluation Methodology (This should include documentation reviews, stakeholder meetings, individual as well as group meetings, etc)
- Evaluation Framework
- Information Collection and Analysis
- Reporting
- Work Scheduling

While the evaluation team will have full access to all information and data the partners have collected throughout the course of the project, the current assessment should be qualitative in nature.

Evaluation Timeframe

The project evaluation is proposed for August 2010 (approximately 3-4 weeks - to be determined). Ron & Martha - this might be stretching it - my apologies for the delays caused over here. I am committed to moving this along at this point. How much time would be needed to contract a Kenyan hydro-geologist/water engineer to assist with this review?

Evaluation Report

The consultant (along with the team) will prepare an evaluation report that describes the evaluation and puts forward the findings, recommendations and lessons learned. A draft report(s) will be submitted to the partners, MCC (Kenya and FDMR) and CFGB no later than the mid-September for feedback, with a final report provided by mid-October.

Evaluator Qualifications

The evaluation will be carried out by a team of two consultants, a Canadian who will lead the evaluation (preferably a food security specialist), and a Kenyan hydro-geologist/water engineer. MCC, CFGB and the implementing partners will also have representation on the evaluation team.